

LIVE CHAT – Gallipoli – 25th April 2009

[Desmond7] What's the format?

[bpc59] You tell us all you know about Gallipoli!

[CGM] Hello Everyone I haven't met!

[Pighills] I know it's on Turkey

[MagicRat] It certainly was two weeks ago

[Desmond7] Lesser known in NI - big interest in South of Ireland.

[brucehubbard] That is about the total of my knowledge too

[Desmond7] More Irish folk 'rebel' songs written with Gallipoli as their key theme than you would believe!

[Paul Reed] Evening all

[Orson] I must admit - I knew little about it before we went!

[Paul Reed] I see you have already started!

[bpc59] Not really - just chatting

[Desmond7] Your pictures were magnificent

[eviltaxman] Evening folks.

[MagicRat] Thanks Des

[Pighills] Sue, Alan it was nice putting faces to names - thank you for the photos

[brucehubbard] Could the Navy have forced the narrows? Did the loss of elderly ships really matter?

[MagicRat] I was a little worried about basically posting our holiday snaps, but they seem to have gone down well

[bpc59] Looks like we're off!

[Pighills] They were much better than holiday snaps!!

[Paul Reed] The photos were good, it's a very photogenic landscape

[MagicRat] Anzac in particular is stunning

[Orson] Though I would have preferred Alan found a different one, Kim!

[Paul Reed] Can I make a suggestion? If we are going to discuss Gallipoli maybe we should start with Bruce's question. If we have too many questions, we will get lost

[bpc59] Fine

[Paul Reed] As Gallipoli started as a Naval op, I think Bruce's question is a good place to begin

[Desmond7] Ok .. opinions on the naval issue?

[Paul Reed] Unless others want a different angle?

[MagicRat] No, it is the crux of the whole thing

[Orson] The only thing that I know about the Naval operation is a little about E 20.

[MagicRat] Certainly in Turkey, they regard 18th March as a great victory

[ybeach] Did the navy offer sufficient support - who co-ordinated the navy / army?

[brucehubbard] Since I asked.....to try to knock the Turks out of the war by bombarding Istanbul from the sea seems a fair idea to me.

[Desmond7] Eric Bush's 'Gallipoli' is written very much from naval perspective

[brucehubbard] We sent, along with the French, a number of obsolete ships, two of which were sunk on mines

[brucehubbard] The Navy then seems to have decided that we would lose too many old ships, and so pulled out. Am I reading this right?

[Paul Reed] It has always seemed that the Naval effort was 'half-hearted'

[Orson] Surely it was impossible to force the narrows. It would have been suicide with the armaments on the coast, surely?

[[MagicRat](#)] Fisher refused to send any of the Navy's best ships - only being happy to sacrifice the older ships

[[Paul Reed](#)] Yes, without silencing the shore batteries it would have been tricky, but as has been stated the mines were the greatest problem

[[brucehubbard](#)] We bombarded the forts from the sea, as well as landing some troops to knock out the batteries. Why could the navy work its way along, bit by bit?

[[Paul Reed](#)] I doubt if a Naval force could have pushed into the sea of Marmara

[[Paul Reed](#)] Bruce, I think any forces landing would have been subject to counter-attack, which they couldn't have fended off for long. Especially on the Asiatic side

[[Orson](#)] I know that the E 20 was torpedoed by a German ship in the Sea of Marmara. Is it known how many German ships were there?

[[Desmond7](#)] You say mines Paul - were these German supplied and when were they laid in their sea-fields?

[[brucehubbard](#)] OK....so....having alerted the Turks to what we had in mind, we then leave it ages before sending troops.....which we land on the tip of the peninsula....as far as possible from the target!

[[Paul Reed](#)] From memory I think the Turks did get military assistance from the Germans in great abundance, which would have included mines I suspect

[[Pighills](#)] So why did they decide to attack the land, rather than keep the onslaught going from the sea?

[[Paul Reed](#)] However, any planner would have known that the narrows were the key defence point, and they may well have had them pre-war

[[Orson](#)] Perhaps they thought they would have more success that way, Kim

[[Paul Reed](#)] Yes, well once the naval op failed, the army was called in to solve, and as Bruce says we chose a point furthest from our final objective

[[vbeach](#)] Paul, please can you expand?

[[MagicRat](#)] A number of landing areas were considered - Helles, Anzac, Suvla (too boggy), Bulair in the North and on the Asian side

[[bpc59](#)] Wasn't Bulair considered ?

[[Paul Reed](#)] All of them suffered from the same problem - distance from the capitol

[[MagicRat](#)] In fact Freyburg did launch a one man demonstration at Bulair

[[Paul Reed](#)] That's what doomed it from the start, IMHO

[[Paul Reed](#)] Yes, he did!

[[Desmond7](#)] Was the plan essentially based on a totally false intelligence appreciation of the fighting qualities of the Turkish soldier?

[[MagicRat](#)] To try and persuade the Turks that something was going on there

[[Paul Reed](#)] Got the DSO for it

[[MagicRat](#)] I would say so, yes, Des

[[Paul Reed](#)] I think that the army agreed to it knowing it would fail

[[MagicRat](#)] "Johnny Turk" would turn tail and fight as soon as our boys showed up

[[Paul Reed](#)] They didn't want Gallipoli to succeed - the army was dominated by Western Fronters

[[brucehubbard](#)] Yes, Des.....as well as having no maps bigger than from a school atlas

[[Paul Reed](#)] The maps they used were from 1854. I have a set

[[MagicRat](#)] The maps thing is a bit contentious - Peter Chasseaud's book argues that decent maps were in fact available

[[brucehubbard](#)] Just how accurate could the maps have been???

[[MagicRat](#)] Although I haven't read it

[[Desmond7](#)] Seriously on the army failure point? Good angle - love to know more ... they bowed to the politicians and what a horrendous cost!

[[Paul Reed](#)] It is true accurate maps were available, but no-one who planned it looked at them

[brucehubbard] Typical

[vbeach] How useful are maps if the Turkish guns were mobile?

[brucehubbard] Did any of the maps show where there might be any water?

[Paul Reed] The problem was that even if they succeeded at Gallipoli, all the way to Constantinople from there is hill range after hill range. Could we have taken them all?

[Desmond7] Yeah the pictures showed that - perfect terrain for defence

[Paul Reed] It was, I suspect, impossible

[MagicRat] And even just considering the peninsula, plenty of hills once you get off the beaches

[Paul Reed] Absolutely

[Desmond7] Can we talk myths?

[vbeach] Why go by Land? Use the Dardanelles once Gallipoli cleared ...

[Paul Reed] Of course, Des

[brucehubbard] Even if we take the first set of hills, and advance further, the Turkish supply lines get shorter, ours elongate, and all our water has to come from Mudros

[Desmond7] Ok

[Paul Reed] vbeach - could we have crossed the Sea of Marmara?

[vbeach] Why not? Once the mines were cleared?

[Paul Reed] What about Turkish and German naval vessels?

[MagicRat] Interesting idea - an amphibious landing inside the sea of Marmara

[Andrew Hesketh] Wasn't the plan that, once the peninsula was secure, the Navy would be freed to move on to Constantinople?

[brucehubbard] But if we could have cleared the mines, then no landing was necessary at all

[MagicRat] Yes, Andrew, and once our ships show up at Constantinople, Turkey switches allegiance

[vbeach] The landing was to help clear the guns

[Andrew Hesketh] That's right!

[MagicRat] Possibly followed by Bulgaria and Rumania

[Orson] But the mines, Bruce, would be cleared after clearing Gallipoli, wouldn't they?

[Paul Reed] Would the Turks have collapsed if had arrived at Constantinople?

[Desmond7] The Turks fighting at Gallipoli are generally accepted as being fair fighters, good blokes etc.?

[Andrew Hesketh] That was the expectation I believe.

[brucehubbard] Why Orson? If the mines could be cleared, then the original Naval plan could have succeeded

[Andrew Hesketh] The mines could only be cleared if the minesweepers were not harried by the forts

[Paul Reed] Des, there are 'issues' with the way Turks treated POWs

[Desmond7] I was about to raise Kut ... Was there a mindset difference by the time of Kut etc?

[brucehubbard] They treated Townsend reasonably!!! I believe he enjoyed the opera.

[Paul Reed] But there were mines, and defences, all the way to Constantinople

[Orson] Possibly a different cultural attitude?

[Andrew Hesketh] True

[vbeach] How serious were these mines? Many of them?

[Desmond7] Don't know - but there was a story in our family which I think got misconstrued over the years.

[Andrew Hesketh] They could sink a very large ship so were taken seriously

[Paul Reed] I think it's difficult to speculate as to what would have been in our path if we had breached the narrows

[Desmond7] My Great Uncle Andy was at Dardanelles. with Royal Inniskilling Fusiliers. .. My father said he had told him about an atrocity.

[ypres1418] Evening everyone, just got in and had to set up java, hope to join in conversation when I am up to speed. x

[brucehubbard] Good to have Matron present in case anyone is hurt on a mine

[Paul Reed] Des - what was the story in your family then?

[ypres1418] Are we talking the mines in the straight plz

[vbeach] Can I ask again - who co-ordinated army AND Navy. Wasn't this the initial problem?

[bpc59] Let's hear Des' story

[Paul Reed] vbeach - yes the co-ordination was a big problem as neither wanted to know the other

[Desmond7] He said Andy told him that wounded men had been 'cut up' ... but I am now convinced he was talking about some of the things which happened in Mesopotamia and swiftly became legend in the army.

[Andrew Hesketh] Wester-Wemyss' (sp??) account shows that coordination was farcical

[Paul Reed] I think both sides were pretty brutal, Des, until they started having the truces to bury the dead. The Brits saw the Turks as sub-human - that comes across very strongly

[bpc59] Where?

[Paul Reed] I have not seen enough Turkish accounts, but it is clear the ordinary soldiers were very afraid of being taken POW

[Paul Reed] In the description of what the Turkish army was about in contemporary papers

[Desmond7] Andy had told my father that it was a matter of honour to get wounded in before nightfall.

[MagicRat] What I've read suggests that the Turks took prisoners if the men were fully fit

[Paul Reed] But once the soldiers met them, especially in No Man's Land during the truces, it is clear the attitudes changed

[Andrew Hesketh] And if not fully fit?

[MagicRat] They were killed

[Andrew Hesketh] Hmm

[PPCLI] I have read reports of many men wounded and treated on the battlefield and left to the mercy of the Turks - none ever turned up as POWs

[MagicRat] But as Paul says, the truce changed much

[Andrew Hesketh] True on both sides?

[brucehubbard] How did the Turks treat their own wounded?

[Paul Reed] Their facilities were medieval

[vbeach] In Tim Travers book, he states the opposite. Fit = killed, ...

[Andrew Hesketh] Howe many prisoners did we take?

[bpc59] I thought it was the other way round too

[MagicRat] Interesting - I know some prisoners ended up working on the railways in Mesopotamia.

[Desmond7] Apologies I have just smelled burning - forgot I had tomorrow's dinner in oven .. disaster!

[MagicRat] I meant to call you tonight Steve - sorry it slipped by mind

[Orson] We were told a story of some Turkish PoW', held on a beach, being burnt alive.

[bpc59] Deliberately?

[Paul Reed] You have to be careful with a lot of the modern stories

[Orson] Yes, petrol was laid and lit

[Paul Reed] There is a political/religious angle to the modern Gallipoli

[Andrew Hesketh] Where did we take Turkish prisoners?

[Krithia] MagicRat - I'll forgive you, give me a call tomorrow evening, I have some 5th Norfolk's bits for you

[MagicRat] Yes, Paul - that was something Eric alluded to

[MagicRat] Will do Steve - thanks

[Krithia] Weren't some Turkish prisoners taken to the Isle of Man ?

[Paul Reed] There are millions of Turks who visit each year who are told that Mustapha Kemal was killed at Chunuk Bair for example. The pocket watch didn't save his life, a NZ bullet killed him. And the British substituted a body double

[MagicRat] We arrived on Sunday and so dozens of Turkish coaches - Eric suggested that the government buses people in and tells them that story

[Paul Reed] Which explains why and how a supposed good Muslim like Kemal secularised Turkey in the 20s

[Andrew Hesketh] Krithia - I hadn't heard that one. Any idea of numbers?

[MagicRat] Indeed

[Krithia] I have heard that one Paul, the doppelganger changed the face of modern Turkey ! Those dastardly British.

[vbeach] Any thoughts on why Suvla failed?

[Stephen Garnett] Hi Ypres. Bussing them in, would that be any different to having the Great War on the National Curriculum?

[Andrew Hesketh] The usual answer to Suvla is that there was no rapid movement following the initial landings

[Paul Reed] Suvla failed because the whole campaign had failed. Unless you pushed inland in the first few days, you were doomed

[brucehubbard] Have we mentioned Hamilton yet?

[MagicRat] I suppose it depends on the quality of the "education" given

[Andrew Hesketh] Could Suvla have salvaged it all though?

[ypres1418] I will ask at work about Gallipoli, we have two Turks working with us

[Paul Reed] I think the trouble is that none of the troops landed at Suvla were given any notional of an operation plan

[ypres1418] Be interesting to see what they have to say

[Krithia] Over 100 Turkish PoWs on the IoM ... I think there was a thread on the forum about it.

[Paul Reed] If they bit off Gallipoli - could they have withstood counter-attacks on what was the main route of Turkish re-supply?

[Andrew Hesketh] Yes Paul, much of what I've read suggests that nobody really knew what the point was

[vbeach] Why no plan for Suvla - who was at fault?

[brucehubbard] Are we back to Hamilton?

[Andrew Hesketh] Can't remember the chap's name now!!

[Paul Reed] I suspect most Gallipoli roads lead back to Hamilton

[vbeach] But didn't he have a chain of command?

[brucehubbard] So if Sir Ian was so totally out of touch, why was he appointed?

[Paul Reed] Upwards or downwards or both?

[Andrew Hesketh] Who was in charge at Suvla again? Memory problem here

[MagicRat] Stopford

[vbeach] Downwards mainly?

[Andrew Hesketh] Stopford!! Thanks

[Paul Reed] I still think the army wanted Gallipoli to fail, so they appointed in their minds the right commander, and used what they saw as the right troops; territorials, colonials and a few regulars to make it look like they were serious

[Krithia] Even if IX Corps took and held Tekke Tepe ridge I doubt this would have made much of a change to the outcome of the campaign. It would have just made Suvla Bay a safer harbour

[MagicRat] The problem to me was that people like Hunter-Weston (at Helles) and Stopford were making the decisions

[Andrew Hesketh] Interesting assertion Paul

[vbeach] Paul - why would they want it to fail?

[brucehubbard] Westerners, rather than easterners

[Paul Reed] So they could fight the real war on the Western Front

[Andrew Hesketh] There's a difference between half-hearted backing and deliberate sabotage though, isn't there?

[ypres1418] But why take so many men away from the western front

[Paul Reed] The numbers were small, and the army didn't really have much regard for most of the units it sent to Gallipoli in the first instance

[brucehubbard] Was the French attitude the same?

[vbeach] Not even the 29th Division??

[Andrew Hesketh] The Navy didn't exactly send state of the art ships either

[Paul Reed] I think they had to send one regular division to make it look serious

[ypres1418] That's not a nice thought though is it if it's true, what about the families that lost all those boys

[Pighills] Is that because they thought the Turks would just roll over?

[Paul Reed] I think they thought the Turks were second rate

[Andrew Hesketh] I suspect that they expected the Turks to be less resilient than they actually were

[Krithia] Gallipoli was a gamble ... on an outsider how much do you bet ... not much!

[Paul Reed] They didn't count on what it means to defend your homeland

[bpc59] Difference between underestimating & sabotage though

[Paul Reed] Mandy, I don't think the army ever really thinks about the families of its men who serve. If it did, it would always be afraid of the losses, and consequences of losses, and thus never fight

[ypres1418] No that was obvious if it is true sad as it is

[6th Shropshires] Do you think it would have worked if there had not been a delay between the first lands by the navy and the main lands

[Pighills] I don't think any army can think of the men as men - it's to emotive and not conducive to making good and necessary decisions

[ypres1418] No maybe not

[Paul Reed] I don't think there could have been a landing in March as not all the troops had been assembled

[Andrew Hesketh] Did the Turks win, or did we lose?

[Paul Reed] Good one, Andrew

[Andrew Hesketh] ...or both...

[ypres1418] We won getting them off didn't we

[brucehubbard] Didn't both sides lose?

[Krithia] We lost the battle, not the war

[MagicRat] The Turks won in that they stopped the invasion

[vbeach] 60:40 to the Turks?

[Andrew Hesketh] Like Dunkirk was a win?!

[Paul Reed] No. Gallipoli was a failure

[brucehubbard] The British are at the most glorious in retreat!

[Orson] The Turks forced us to evacuate...

[Andrew Hesketh] The evacuation was well handled though

[MagicRat] Very much so

[Paul Reed] Yes, somewhat ironically our finest hour was as we left

[ypres1418] Best part of the whole campaign from where I am sitting

[Andrew Hesketh] Presumably the Turks celebrated madly - but I've never really read about it.

[vbeach] Surely the Turks must have known we were evacuating before it happened?

[MagicRat] I hate to think how we would look upon Gallipoli if the Turks had attacked the evacuating troops

[Andrew Hesketh] Shame that a lot of the WD's were burned in the evacuation

[brucehubbard] Might the Germans rather that we stayed there...tying down more troops....making them unavailable for the Western Front?

[ypres1418] I presume so

[Paul Reed] Andrew - which diaries were burnt? Not heard that before

[MagicRat] Possibly, but the winter rains would have washed our troops into the sea

[Andrew Hesketh] 9th Sherwoods for certain. And (I think) the RWF territorials

[ypres1418] Why were they burnt

[Paul Reed] Really - it's just that I helped Ray Westlake with British Battalions at Gallipoli and don't remember any missing diaries

[bpc59] Security ?

[PPCLI] Certainly no 9th Sherwoods

[Andrew Hesketh] With regards to the 9th Sherwoods, they destroyed all records before departure. Don't really know why. Bury the evidence

[ypres1418] But taking them with them would have been better surely

[vbeach] Some RDF diaries are missing as they had no one to write them ...

[Paul Reed] That's an odd thing to do

[Orson] Makes you wonder what was in them.

[ypres1418] Too true Orson

[Andrew Hesketh] As I said, it buries the evidence for an expected enquiry....

[Paul Reed] That could be it, I suspect many realised there would be some sort of enquiry

[Andrew Hesketh] I think so Paul - but that's my view, no proof

[ypres1418] Would have to be relatives would want answers even then

[vbeach] Do any personal diaries mention this?

[Paul Reed] None that I have read, most men seemed embarrassed to be leaving, and leaving their dead mates behind

[Andrew Hesketh] I can't speak for all units - and I wish Steve Morse were here to confirm - but there are very few diaries from the 9th Sherwoods. I've only ever seen one. I wonder if they were not allowed out

[Paul Reed] That's a very strong thread in Australian accounts, as 'mateship' meant so much to them

[ypres1418] Ok guys n gals I am tired so going now, just done 3 long days! Enjoy the rest of the evening xx to all

[vbeach] My grandfather was one of those who survived, but we have no information about his time in Gallipoli or diary ...

[Andrew Hesketh] vbeach - which unit?

[vbeach] Royal Dublin Fusiliers (joined in Derby)

[Andrew Hesketh] Derby? Derbyshire lad?

[Paul Reed] I presume he took part in the V Beach landing?

[vbeach] Sorry - lived in Derbyshire, joined in Brum

[vbeach] Yes he did

[Andrew Hesketh] Why the RDF - do you know?

[vbeach] Not a clue - we would love to know ...

[Paul Reed] As a pre-war regular he could elect to join anyone

[Paul Reed] Anyone else with family connections to Gallipoli?

[bpc59] Great-uncle in RAMC at Suvla

[[Joanna Hyslop](#)] Yes, my grandfather

[[vbeach](#)] According to Tom Burke (RDF Association) my Granddad is one of 11 survivors of the original 1,100 RDF who landed on 25th April V Beach

[[Paul Reed](#)] What unit Joanna?

[[PPCLI](#)] Two of my great uncles served with the 1st KOSB - both survived.

[[Joanna Hyslop](#)] Rev Charles Dobson Otago Mounted Rifles

[[Andrew Hesketh](#)] Not family, but Abergele where I live is strongly connected. 10th August 1915 was the town's worst day of the war.

[[Paul Reed](#)] A padre at Gallipoli - fascinating!

[[Joanna Hyslop](#)] He is mentioned as being at Hill 60 August 28th

[[Pighills](#)] Why so Paul?

[[6th Shropshires](#)] My dad's second cousin D of W there

[[Paul Reed](#)] Their job at Gallipoli was a hard one - there was no 'behind the lines' as there was for padres on the WF

[[Joanna Hyslop](#)] There when Chaplain Grant was shot they were touring the trenches - didn't recognise Red Cross armbands

[[Paul Reed](#)] Plus they were forever dealing with burying the dead, as well as trying to help the living, and stay alive themselves

[[Paul Reed](#)] Quite a few padres KIA at Gallipoli

[[Pighills](#)] I see - thank you

[[MagicRat](#)] We visited the grave of one at Embarkation Pier cemetery

[[Joanna Hyslop](#)] Don't know much more - OMG's virtually wiped out

[[Paul Reed](#)] Yes, they were - did he survive?

[[Joanna Hyslop](#)] Trying to find out more though!

[[Joanna Hyslop](#)] Yes - he was on Western Front earned MC

[[Paul Reed](#)] No Gallipoli diary for him then?

[[vbeach](#)] Sorry to leave you all - midnight in Turkey and we have a long drive to Eric's tomorrow. Most enjoyable chat, we will take all your thoughts and good wishes to Gallipoli. Best wishes ...

[[Joanna Hyslop](#)] I think there are bits of OMG war diaries which I must find

[[Orson](#)] I wondered how you made it tonight!

[[bpc59](#)] Thank you for joining in

[[MagicRat](#)] Have a great trip

[[Paul Reed](#)] Have a memorable time in Gallipoli and say hi to Eric for me

[[MagicRat](#)] See if Eric will take you out in his 4x4!

[[vbeach](#)] Last one MagicRat - be sure he will!!

[[Paul Reed](#)] So what did our latest converts to Gallipoli make of their recent battlefield trip

[[MagicRat](#)] Wonderful - as soon as we left, I was plotting our return

[[bpc59](#)] What surprised you the most?

[[MagicRat](#)] The terrain at Anzac - even hillier than I expected

[[Pighills](#)] Alan I could almost feel the atmosphere there through your photos - they are magic!!

[[MagicRat](#)] Glad you like them

[[Orson](#)] I had an idea of what the landscape would be like - low shrubs etc - and was surprised to see so many trees.

[[Andrew Hesketh](#)] Sorry - have to go. Excellent chat. Really enjoyed it. Night all.

[[Paul Reed](#)] There was even more once! Until the Park fire

[[bpc59](#)] Paul - were you there after the fire?

[[MagicRat](#)] Also surprised by how wild and remote Suvla is

[[Paul Reed](#)] Not for some time, no

[Orson] I understand that it changed due to the fact that it has become a national park. People aren't even allowed to pick up dead wood for fires.

[bpc59] That must have been the time to see the landscape

[Paul Reed] Gallipoli was hard to understand before the fire - too many trees in places. And many areas no-go because of the military

[brucehubbard] I have really enjoyed the last hour. Many thanks all.

[MagicRat] There is still quite a military presence on the peninsula. We saw hundreds of soldiers at the Gaba Tepe museum

[Orson] On two occasions we saw soldiers - national service? in the area.

[Paul Reed] The whole of Turkey is like that, though, isn't it?

[bpc59] Any army bases still there?

[Paul Reed] Yes, in every town. But not on the beaches any more, thankfully

[Orson] On another occasion they were at The Nek. They were being talked to and had to stand back to let us through. Almost like inspecting the soldiers, but from a car!

[Paul Reed] There used to be a base at Krithia, but that seems to have been de-commissioned

[bpc59] Any contact with any locals - their reaction to Western tourists? (To Alan & Sue)

[MagicRat] As we drove through Krithia, we sensed every eye following us!

[MagicRat] Really, apart from Eceabat - the place is very quiet

[Pighills] Possibly because they're not that used to too many tourists?

[MagicRat] Well, at the moment, they'll have several thousand Anzacs!

[bpc59] Apart from this weekend presumably

[Paul Reed] I think the figure is 4-6 millions Turks a year visiting Gallipoli

[Pighills] Really???

[Paul Reed] Yes

[Orson] Impressed by the number of gardeners we saw. Probably because Anzac day was approaching. Saw one very carefully dusting down the headstones.

[geraint] Hi folks. Is this a private, or a public chat?

[MagicRat] But mainly at the weekends, according to Eric at Gallipoli Houses

[MagicRat] Public - please join in!

[bpc59] All welcome

[Paul Reed] I have never seen any figures for UK/Commonwealth visitors, but the increasing infrastructure of tours, B&Bs etc seems to suggest it is on the up

[Joanna Hyslop] Do the Turks regard the campaign as a victory today?

[Paul Reed] Yes, and a spiritual one now. They are told that Allah won the campaign, or rather the hand of Allah

[Joanna Hyslop] Spiritual? Well I guess that's inevitable

[Stephen Garnett] It is important to remember that the Ottoman Empire dwarfed Western Europe for much of the past 500 years.

[Paul Reed] Oh yes, very true

[Orson] W.r.t. Turkish visitors, we saw a new parking lot at the Turkish Memorial that only had room for 4 cars and a large turning circle for coaches.

[Paul Reed] The Turkish groups focus on ANZAC. They don't go to Suvla or much of Helles. Makes those places a little easier to visit!

[MagicRat] We did see a coach load at Helles, but many more at Anzac. And even at Anzac, only Second Ridge, not the coast road

[Krithia] You can say the same for the Aussies and Kiwis, few get to Helles or Suvla

[Paul Reed] There is the "market" near to the Helles Memorial, which can make a visit there a little tricky

[Paul Reed] That's true Steve

[bpc59] Why that focus? On Anzac as opposed to the other sites.

[Krithia] Mustapha Kemal was there

[Paul Reed] Most Aussies and NZ'ers are there for one day, and just want to see ANZAC. Few realise the Australians and NZs even fought at Helles!

[Krithia] That's true

[bpc59] So for a comparative Gallipoli novice - what book is the best entry point?

[MagicRat] We were told the story of a couple of rich Aussies, who hired a helicopter - landed at Anzac Cove for an hour, and were happy they'd seen everything!

[Paul Reed] Defeat At Gallipoli Steel/Hart is good. Steve (Krithia) has written two good books on Gallipoli in the BE series

[MagicRat] Have to say I liked Carlyon's book

[Krithia] Rhodes-James - Gallipoli

[bpc59] Is Carlyon ANZAC based?

[MagicRat] Very much yes

[Paul Reed] Yes, Carylton's book is good, too

[geraint] I'm a novice too - good question bpc59

[MagicRat] Not exclusively though. Very readable though

[Paul Reed] Best guidebook for the whole area is Taylor/Cupper

[bpc59] Steve - I have Gully, what's the other one?

[Krithia] Anzac - The Landing

[MagicRat] Taylor/Cipper is very good - tiny print though

[bpc59] Thanks

[Krithia] I am working on a Suvla one as we speak ...

[MagicRat] Much on the Norfolks?

[Joanna Hyslop] Krithia - which?

[geraint] Any Welsh regiments? 5th RWF?

[Krithia] Best guide book is definitely Taylor/Cupper. There are one or two good Turkish ones too

[Stephen Garnett] Night all - a very enjoyable listen!

[Paul Reed] Yes, that new Turkish one is good - friend of Bill Sellar's, Steve?

[bpc59] Is this available in the UK - title?

[Paul Reed] I got mine in Gallipoli

[Krithia] Re the Norfolks, we think we have found the farm and deep gully where the Sandringhams were surrounded and bodies later buried.

[Paul Reed] I think I did post some details on the forum in 2007 when I got it?

[Krithia] They got a lot further than some people think

[bpc59] Ok I'll check back Paul

[bpc59] Inside Pierrepont Edwards square though ?

[Krithia] Yes Paul, co-authored by Sahin Aldogan ... a mastermind on Gallipoli and been visiting the battlefield since the 60's

[MagicRat] We think we found the farm with Eric last week - will be interested to see if we agree on the same spot!

[MagicRat] I don't think the Turkish guide is available in the UK - Eric had a copy at Gallipoli Houses

[Krithia] Yes, within the square, eastern side

[Joanna Hyslop] Night all - and thanks - it was very interesting.

[Krithia] MagicRat - it's could well be, very near the Turkish Second line later in the campaign.

[Paul Reed] Steve - any news of the Linesman Gallipoli version?

[bpc59] Guy said it has been tested in the field

[Krithia] Not yet, I was out last year and tested it. There is a little work to do on some maps, but results were excellent ... 95% accuracy

[Paul Reed] It's Steve who has been testing it!

[Paul Reed] That's good

[bpc59] OK !

[Krithia] I did a lot of walking with Haluk Oral around Lone Pine with the GPs ... he was amazed

[Pighills] OK, that's me done too - BPC and CGM, I leave the rest up to you two. Night Folks!!

[Paul Reed] So Alan, when is your next trip!?

[MagicRat] Well, next month we are going to Poland with Sue's dad and uncle. Krakow, and Auschwitz. Will be very emotional, I expect

[Krithia] I must get some shuteye now, long drive in the morning. Night all, catch up again soon

[MagicRat] Night Steve - speak to you tomorrow

[Paul Reed] I have never been to Auschwitz, part of me doesn't want to go

[bpc59] Night Steve - thanks for contributing

[MagicRat] Yes, I know what you mean

[Orson] Part of me doesn't want to but another part of me says I must.

[MagicRat] Then on the WW1 front, we've a few days at Varlet Farm in October

[bpc59] Going to be very difficult for you Sue

[Paul Reed] That's nice

[Orson] Even more difficult for Dad and my uncle I suspect.

[bpc59] yes

[Paul Reed] Ok, am going to say goodnight, too. Been an excellent evening - here's to many more. Any ideas for the next subject?

[MagicRat] Night Paul - thanks for your thoughts

[bpc59] Goodnight Paul & thanks for your help

[MagicRat] next subject..hmmm...

[Orson] Goodnight Paul and thanks for the insights

[bpc59] What do you suggest?

[Paul Reed] No worries, always happy to chat about Gallipoli

[bpc59] May

[Paul Reed] Not SAD...

[MagicRat] Please no!

[bpc59] we'll have a think on it & PM some suggestions ?

[Paul Reed] May - 94 years since the end of Second Ypres - how about 'was it worth defending the Salient'?

[MagicRat] Good one

[Paul Reed] On that thought, I shall leave you!

[Paul Reed] Goodnight all!